



# The Strategic Master Plan for Petra Region

**June 2011**

**Contracting Authority:**

The Petra Development and Tourism Region Authority  
Attn.: Mr. Mohammad Farajat  
Project Administrator  
Procurement Division  
Wadi Musa, Jordan  
Tel +962 (3) 2157093

**Contractor:**

ATC Consultants GmbH  
Seilerstaette 7/4,  
A-1010 Vienna, Austria  
[www.atc-consultants.com](http://www.atc-consultants.com)  
å

In Association with  
DesignWorkshop and  
JCP s.r.l.

# Table of Content

Table of Content .....	2
1 Overall Work Schedule.....	3
2 Summary of assignments and its activities and outputs.....	4
2.1 Interviews .....	4
2.2 Data Collection Process.....	5
2.3 Reporting .....	8
3 Activities in the current final period (Task 7) .....	9
3.1 Contractual & Management Issues .....	9
3.2 Tasks performed.....	9
3.3 Involved experts in the Strategic Master Plan .....	9
4 Summary of discussion (Q & A) at workshops .....	11
4.1 Technical Infrastructure .....	11
4.2 Investments & Tourism Development.....	13
4.3 PAP & Tourism in Protected Areas .....	15
4.4 Local community .....	16
4.5 Environment.....	17
4.6 Comments for PDTRA (administrative & financial issues) .....	17
4.7 Comments on SMP .....	18
5 Recommendations to PDTRA regarding PAP boundaries and buffer zone .....	23

# 1 Overall Work Schedule

## Overall objective:

The overall objective of the project is to provide the PDTRA with a Strategic Master Plan that guides planned development of the Petra region in an efficient, balanced and sustainable way over the next 20 years for the benefit of the local population and Jordan in general. Special consideration is required for the protection of the globally significant Petra Archaeological Park, which lies wholly within the area, as well as integrating the planning and zoning regulations for Zones A, B and C, known as the 'Buffer Zone'.

**Project Duration:** 11 months (21<sup>st</sup> of July 2010 – 15<sup>th</sup> of June 2011)

**Project activities and Outputs** (current activity marked in yellow):

Task No.	Deliverable Name	Due Date as per contract	Due Date after extension of contract
1	Initial Diagnostic	9 weeks (23/09/2010)	
2	Public Consultation/ Stakeholder Workshop: diagnostic	10 weeks (30/09/2010)	
3	Detailed analysis, scenarios and strategy development.	20 weeks (08/12/2010)	
4	Public Consultations/ Stakeholder Workshop: Scenarios and Strategy	21 weeks (15/12/2010)	
5	Strategic Master Plan	28 weeks (02/02/2011)	March 5 <sup>th</sup> 2011
6	Selected strategic areas plan	34 weeks (16/03/2011)	May 15 <sup>th</sup> 2011
7	Handover	36 weeks (30/03/2011)	<b>June 15<sup>th</sup> 2011</b>

## 2 Summary of assignments and its activities and outputs

The process of developing the Strategic Master Plan for the Petra region incorporated a diagnostic phase, Public Consultation/ Stakeholder Workshops (for the Diagnostic phase), detailed analysis to develop scenarios and strategy development, Public Consultations/ Stakeholder Workshop (for the Scenarios and Strategy) and selected strategic areas plan.

A set of interviews with people from the local community and various stakeholders were done. In addition to a series of workshops which were conducted on three stages: the first workshops were held in September in which our SWOT analysis was based on, the second in February for international – national consultations in regards to the initial diagnostic report's findings and the third and last was in April where the results of the Strategic Master Plan were presented.

This section provides a summary of the findings from Task 5 to Task 6 reports in which the detailed analysis, scenarios and strategy, including guidelines and regulations to encourage private investments while protecting the park. These findings **are largely integrated in the series of individual community reports as well as the holistic one.**

### 2.1 Interviews

The consultants meet around 400 people in the course of the consultation process with the local community and the stakeholders. Where Over 100 individual meetings were done with;

- 1) **Community representatives** of the six communities (Men & Women)
- 2) **Tourism stakeholders;** Hotel managers/Owners, Tour agencies, Tourism associations such as; JTB (Jordan Tourism Board) and Jordan Hotel Association and tour guides (Amman & Petra region)
- 3) **Governmental officials;** Ministry of Tourism, Department of Antiquities, Ministry of Energy and Mineral Resources, Natural Resources Authorities, Department of Land and Surveys, Ministry of Education, Ministry of Public Health, Ministry of Municipal Affairs, Ministry of Agriculture, and ASEZA (Aqaba Special Economic Zone Authority)
- 4) **Public and Private institutions and organizations;** RSCN (Royal Society of Conservation of nature), NCARE (National Center for Agricultural

Research & Extension, PNT (Petra National Trust), JITAO (Jordan Inbound Tour Operators Associations), British Institute Amman, ACOR (American Center of Oriental Research, UNESCO – Amman Office representation (United Nation Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization, JETT (Jordan Express Tourist Transportation Co.), Engicon Co. and Aqaba Water Co.

## 2.2 Data Collection Process

The process of collecting data was met with difficulties. The procedure of identifying sources of data took much time in both desk research and word of mouth. The public entities and NGOs were reluctant to share information and requested an official letter from the PDTRA in order to provide the team with the desired information; this required multiple visits to the entities by the experts as well as continuous phone calls to push the process forward. An additional obstacle was the little communication across agencies, so that simply finding out who to talk to was very time consuming.

Also the private sector was sometimes reluctant to share data and information with the team, which again consumed much of the team’s time to obtain them. Therefore it is recommended to PDTRA to keep on collecting data, to store it in a database and to update it regularly.

### Data collected (See CD in Annex)

Reports and Documents	
Source	Title
ASEZA (Aqaba Special Economic Zone Authority)	Aqaba Marketing Tourism Report
Dar al Handasah	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Petra Priority Action Plan Study</li> <li>• Outline development &amp; growth scenarios – Petra Region</li> </ul>
Department of Civil Status	Statistics of number of Petra Region population
Department of Statistics	Agriculture, Annual Family Income & expenditure, Birth Numbers by Sex, Climate – Rainfall, Construction, Education, Electricity, Job Creation, Labor & Wages, Employment & Unemployment, Population Indicators & Projections, Poverty Pockets, Transportation, Communication, Travel, Tourism & Services, Building (Type, Number, Ownership) in Petra Region
ICOMOS	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Charter for the Protection and Management of Archaeological Heritage</li> <li>• International Cultural Tourism Charter, Managing Tourism at Places of Heritage Significance</li> </ul>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• International Charter for the Conservation and Restoration of Monuments and Sites (The Venice Charter)</li> </ul>
IRADA project	Hasanat 2009 Socio-Economic report for Petra Region
JTB	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Statistics of Visitor's Flow</li> <li>• Visitors Complaints letters</li> </ul>
Ministry of Education	Statistics of Schools in Petra Region
Ministry of Environment,	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Fourth National Report on Implementation of the Convention on Biological Diversity Jordan</li> <li>• Jordan's Second National Communication to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNECCC).</li> </ul>
Ministry of Health	Statistical data of hospitals and Clinics in Petra region
Ministry of Tourism and Antiquities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Jordan National Tourism Strategy 2004 – 2010</li> <li>• Fourth Annual Report</li> <li>• Statistical Data (Visitor's Flow, Package Tours, Hotels, Tourism Indicators, Tourism Services...etc)</li> </ul>
PDTRA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• PDTRA law</li> <li>• Local Community</li> <li>• Environment</li> <li>• PAP</li> </ul>
PNT (Petra National Trust)	Statistics for visitors flow
Scientific Articles	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Paleo-seismology and archaeo-seismology of sites in Aqaba and Petra, Jordan</li> <li>• Flood analysis and mitigation for Petra area in Jordan</li> <li>• Vulnerability of the drinking water resources of the Nabateans of Petra - Jordan</li> </ul>
SIGMA	Analytical Studies Detailed Land Use Plan and Special Regulations for The Protection of The Area long Taybeh – Wadi Musa Scenic Road
The US National Parks Service	Petra Archaeological Park Operating Plan (3 Vol)
UNESCO	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Petra Archaeological Park Management Plans</li> <li>• Periodic Reporting Exercise on the Application of the World Heritage Convention in the Arab Region. Jordan. Petra: World Heritage</li> <li>• "Periodic Report and Regional Program Arab States 200-2003"</li> <li>• World Heritage Report 11</li> </ul>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• World Heritage Paper 25</li> <li>• World Heritage and Buffer Zones”</li> <li>• Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage</li> <li>• Tourism, Culture and Development in the Arab Region</li> </ul>
UNESCO World Heritage Center	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention</li> <li>• World Heritage Manuals, Managing Tourism at World Heritage Sites: a Practical Manual for World Heritage Sites Management.</li> </ul>
US/ICOMOS	Management Analysis & Recommendations for the Petra World Heritage Site
USIAD/Jordan Tourism Development Project II	Proposed Turkmniyya road, shuttle service - Petra
USIAD/Jordan Tourism Development Project Siyaha II	Petra Visitor Center Upgrade
World Bank	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Jordan Second Tourism Project, Staff Appraisal Document</li> <li>• Jordan Second Tourism Project, Implementation Completion Report</li> </ul>

<b>Maps</b>	
<b>Source</b>	<b>Title</b>
Electricity Distribution Company (EDCO)	Electricity Network (Stations and Feeders)
Ministry of Agriculture	Forest and Agricultural Suitable Soils and Bare Rock Areas
Ministry of Education	Location of Schools in Petra Region
Ministry of Water and Irrigation	Sewer Networks
Natural Resources Authority	Soil maps
Orange company	Telecommunication networks in Petra Region
PDTRA	GIS data: Country Context, Local Context, Fault Lines, Land Marks, Public-Governmental ownership, Private Land Parcel Boundary, Conceptual Land Use for PAP reserve, Monument Sites, Areas Served by Schools and Satellite Images
PNT (Petra National Trust)	Bird Habitats

RJGC (Royal Jordanian Geographic Center)	"quad maps" 1:50,000 - (Petra, Qurayqra/Fidan, Bir Khidaad & Ras an-Naqab). Each of these sections has seven layers including streets (also secondary roads), place names, hydrology, spot elevations, and contour data at 20m intervals
RSCN (Royal Society for Conservation of Nature)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Dana Reserve Trails</li> <li>• Historic Tourism Trails</li> <li>• Masoudha and Rahmeh Reserves</li> </ul>
UNESCO (Amman Office)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Archaeological sites</li> <li>• Existing Land use</li> <li>• Park's boundary and zoning</li> </ul>
University of Arizona	ASU Archeological Sites

### 2.3 Reporting

18 bi-weekly reports were submitted and 6 task reports (including the 6 individual community reports).



## 3 Activities in the current final period (Task 7)

**From the 30<sup>th</sup> of April till the 15<sup>th</sup> of May 2011**

This report is reviewing and summarizing the assignments of the Strategic Master Plans for the Region and Selected Areas based on the feedback of the PDTRA on the submitted draft versions.

This summary report is the outcome of the last visit and is conveyed with the handover of all documents in paper and digital form.

### 3.1 Contractual & Management Issues

*No further issues were raised.*

### 3.2 Tasks performed

**Task 5:** Strategic Master Plan was submitted along with a set of annexes on the 6<sup>th</sup> of May 2011

**Task 6:** Strategic Area Plans for each of the six communities of the Petra Region was submitted. A feedback is needed to finalize the Strategic Master Plan for the Petra Region

**Task 7:** Reviewing and summarizing the assignments of the Strategic Master Plans for the Region and Selected Areas. **Workshop report summarizing key findings, recommendations and agreements to PTDR on key issues are presented later in section 4 and the PPP is in annex.**

**On the 12<sup>th</sup> of May 2011**

Our International experts Kurt Culbertson (Senior Spatial & Urban Planner) and his team conducted a videoconference with the staff of PDTRA in order to transfer knowledge associated with the GIS database and planning process. It was a learning session where the staff of PDTRA learned how to continue working to refine the collected data and procured maps and to advance planning in the PDTRA.

### 3.3 Involved experts in the Strategic Master Plan

- Walther Czerny, Senior Tourism Specialist (WC)
- Kurt Culbertson, Senior Spatial & Urban Planner Specialist (KC)
- Dr. Markus Grillitsch, Economics Specialist (MG)
- Dr. Bernd von Droste, Senior UNESCO World Heritage Specialist (BD)
- Dr. Georg Hauser, Traffic Specialist (GH)

- Dr. Erin H. Addison, Landscape Architect and Environment Specialist (EA)
- Dr. Saad Al-Ayyash, Civil and Environmental Engineering Specialist (SA)
- Dr. Rida Ali Nejem Al-Admat, GIS and Land Use Management Specialist (RA)
- Sara Egan, Junior Urban Planning Expert (SE)
- Lina Salameh, Junior Sociology Expert (LS)
- Eng. Majed Naber, Urban Planer/Local Expert (MN)
- Ghassan Nasser, Tourism and Archaeology/Local Expert (GN)
- Sawsan Issa, Junior Assistant Project Administrator Expert/Translator: (SI)
- Felicitas v. Droste, Junior Assistant Project Administrator Expert (FD)

## 4 Summary of discussion (Q & A) at workshops

### **From the 23<sup>rd</sup> to 26<sup>th</sup> of September 2010**

Fourteen workshops were held for Men and Women separately for the six communities as well the tourism sector in Petra Region and Academics. The consortium did the invitation process, the list of invited people was obtained from the Governor and many others were advised by PDTRA in which everyone was welcomed to come. These workshops were the base of the SWOT analysis. Detailed information can be found in the “*Analysis of Workshops Questionnaires Report in Annex to Task 5 Report*”.

### **On the 16<sup>th</sup> of October 2010**

Two workshops were held for youth males and females separately. The invitation process was conducted by the consortium with the assistance of the Directory of Education in Wadi Musa. Detailed information can be found in the “*Analysis of Workshops Questionnaires Report in Annex to Task 5 Report*”.

### **On the 7<sup>th</sup> of February 2011**

Two workshops were held for Men and Women separately for the six communities. Invitation process was done by PDTRA. The team presented the finding of the Initial Diagnostic Report.

### **From the 19<sup>th</sup> to 21<sup>st</sup> of April 2011**

Three workshops were held for Men, Women and Academia local communities separately. The Invitation process was done by the PDTRA. The outcome of the consultation workshops with the local community and the various stakeholders were a series of comments, questions and suggestions on the bellow subjects. The outputs were debated but seemingly supported by the locals.

## **4.1 Technical Infrastructure**

- **The need for an airport**  
*The Consultant’s team does not see an economically viable option for an airport in the Petra Region. Within PDTRA it is not likely to be technically feasible as well, particularly because of the ‘no fly zone’ over the PAP.*
- **To remove the speed bumps**  
*Not to be recommended, both from a safety (children on the roads!) and an environmental point of view.*
- **Solve transportation problems between Taybeh, Rajif and Dlagha**  
*Improvement of transportation – particularly among the outlying regions is an important part of the SMP.*
- **Establish a new road from Hisheh forest to Qrara**

- **Establish a new road from the youth Club to Al sader area to decrease the traffic problem**  
*The consultant's team sees both above-mentioned projects favourably.*
- **Continue building infrastructure to reach all areas of Petra region**  
*This is one of the key recommendations of the SMP.*
- **There should be a realistic surveying of the location of the wadis**  
*The consultant's team recommends a thorough survey of the entire PDTRA, particularly the wadi areas.*
- **Transportation should be by a train not buses and cars**  
*An electric tramway alternative was seriously considered as an ecologically sound alternative; however, due to steep slopes and technical issues (grease, sand and heat are likely to lead to technical problems and frequent stoppages). Another trans-regional project was strongly recommended: the re-installment of the Hejaz Railroad from Istanbul to Medina, which may have a strong and positive influence on Petra as well.*
- **There should be plans for outdoor areas in WM and to move governmental building outside WM**  
*The claim for additional outdoor areas in WM is strongly supported by the consultants. However, a move of governmental buildings outside of WM would need most careful consideration, because the local population may see such move unfavourably (no suitable transportations, visits to government offices are being combined with shopping etc.)*
- **Requesting to have the "Elgi" village as a museum**  
*The group that has received the license to develop Elgi foresees at least for part of Elgi a cultural use (experiencing the traditional life of WM")*
- **Did the SMP take in consideration the need of expanding and developing the infrastructure for the coming 20 years to be ready for the increase of number of tourists?**  
*Yes, increase of tourists AND local population was calculated in detail in 4 different growth scenarios.*
- **Why is there no industrial strategy?**  
*The subject of industry is being considered in the SMP. As far as heavy (large) industry is concerned, the Petra Region is simply not a suitable location (not sufficient resources of raw materials, energy and water available, as well as no trained work force). However, light industry (manufacturing of souvenirs, agriculture and processing of agricultural products, Herbal medicine etc.) has been considered and is recommended in the SMP. This should be seen at first in context with the tourism activities in the region; eventually – provided a high quality level is reached – some of these products may also be sold and exported independently from tourism.*

## 4.2 Investments & Tourism Development

- **Make Baidha an attractive tourism area**  
*The Consultant's team recommends putting a strong focus on Baidha as a high quality tourism area and has recommended several investment projects for this community.*
- **The priority is for the investors (National and International) not for the local community**  
*The Consultant's team recommends that ALL investments should be at first offered to local investors – either individually, or also to groups of investors and local associations, in order to keep as much of the local value added in the Petra Region; only for some larger projects investment from outside the Region, nationally or internationally, should be attracted.*
- **Establish an entire tourism village for new attractions**  
*Tourists usually do not appreciate 'artificially' created tourist villages. Therefore, the Consultant's team is recommending a concentration of tourists at some areas (e.g. near the entrance of PAP) as 'areas with high intensity tourism', whereas other areas should be designated as 'low intensity tourism areas'. It is recommended that some parts of the Petra Region should be kept as 'tourism free zones'.*
- **Establish down town in WM for tourism attraction**  
*The Consultant's team recommends down town WM to be the place where local people and tourists meet and mingle on equal terms. Here the new Nabataean Museum should be located and shops should continue to serve the local population, but gain additional revenue through amore intensive tourist traffic; for that purpose, an attractive main square of WM with pedestrian shopping streets around it is recommended.*
- **Establish new tourist roads in WM for new shops**  
*The downtown WM main square recommended by the Consultant's team would offer exactly that: a newly restored attractive shopping area.*
- **Ensure a strategy that introduces a "brand-label" on their local products**  
*The establishment of a strong brand for ALL locally manufactured products should be one of the first and a highly important goal of the DMO-Destination Management Organization suggested in the SMP.*
- **There should be an investment strategy for "Al-Hayy" area**  
*Restoring and developing Al-Hayy is highly recommended by the Consultant's team; however, it would rather be recommended for quality private housing for families who desire to move out from downtown WM.*
- **There should be an equal distribution of tourism projects in the region**  
*A fair distribution is strongly recommended, not necessarily an equal distribution: thus zones of higher and lesser intensity of tourism are being recommended as well as some zones with no tourism. However, the population from all the Petra Region, independent from tribes, families, gender and personal background should have equal access to education and*

consequently equal opportunity in accessing the job market in all tourism enterprises in the Petra Region.

- **There should be an international library**

*This idea is strongly supported by the Consultant's team who recommend in the SMP the installation of a library bus as it is successfully operated in remote areas of many European countries.*

- **Should work more on developing the regulations for investment promotion plans**

*It is strongly recommended that the Commissioner for Investment and Tourism together with the soon to be established DMO will design a forceful investment promotion strategy.*

- **What is the strategy to compensate the local community when the tourism sector is falling apart**

*The Consultant's team recommends maintaining a minimum level of agriculture in the area for such eventuality (which usually does not last long, but is always a possibility). In addition, local manufacturing (souvenirs and local crafts, food and herbs etc.) should be supported and promoted.*

- **How can we prevent having international investment and keeping it for the local community**

*The Consultant's team recommends investments to be preferentially offered to local investors – however, some investment from outside may be needed as well, possibly in partnership with local investors*

- **We did not see a location for the proposed new hotels**

*Principally, new hotels should be permitted in all areas of low or higher intensity zones, some of them marked on the land use plans.*

- **What is the guarantee to have management for the DMO from the local community**

*The criteria for the management of the DMO foresee good international know how in the field and knowledge of the local situation as equally important. With equal qualifications a local management should be given preference; however, being local alone should never be the decisive factor, because for this position a high qualification is required.*

- **Why to have DMO, the PDTRA can do the work**

*The PDTRA and DMO have different functions: The PDTRA is responsible for administrative, legal and regulatory issues as well as the enforcement of these regulations. The DMO is responsible to develop – within this framework – together with the local community, the business sector and NGOs commercially viable products, provide marketing for these products, strengthen the capacities of local businesses, etc. Hence, they also require different qualifications - PDTRA requires top administrative, legal, urban planning, public finance qualifications whereas the DMO Management requires top qualities in product and business development, marketing and management. This does in now way mean a vilification of one or the other*

position – both are equally important but have to fulfil different functions for which also different qualifications are required.

### 4.3 PAP & Tourism in Protected Areas

- **We did not see a strategy to protect the PAP**  
*This was not part of the contract; one of the main goals of the SMP is nevertheless to develop activities outside of the PAP in order to take pressure from the endangered area.*
- **Is it possible to do large scale development inside the PAP**  
*No development of any construction is recommended within PAP.*
- **The interpretation center of Baidha will be in- or outside PAP**  
*It may be at the very outer limit of PAP or on the other side of the road.*
- **What is the future of the horses? Horses do not pollute the PAP**  
*Horses and animals are an important part of the culture and economic activity in the region. Therefore, it is suggested to develop and actively promote the Petra Animal Park. Animal holders will receive a license to keep their animals in the context of the Animal Park. However, the Consultant's team recommends in the long run (within 5 – 12 years) to have all commercially used animals removed from the PAP (with the exception of a limited number of horses and donkeys for riding out of PAP from the back gate. Unfortunately, any excess number of animals within the park may harm the sensitive soft stone of Petra.*
- **What is the strategy for PAP e.g. the animals and commercial shops etc**  
*It is the conviction of the consultants that the shops **within** the PAP are by far not making the turnover they could make in the context of a professionally organized Souq or Bazaar at the exit of the park; in almost all sites of comparable importance, selling goods at the exit of the site has proven more profitable.*
- **There are no recommendations for new trails inside PAP**  
*The consultants are recommending in the SMP to create many more trails for trekking tours inside and around PAP, including the Masoudha and Dana protected areas; they are convinced that many more professionally trained escorts (guides with a license limiting their services to the Petra Region) could find jobs, particularly as guides for such treks. However, no specific trails were recommended and elaborated, since planning activities inside the PAP was explicitly excluded from the contract*
- **How do you solve the problem of the misuse of the archeological park by tourists and the local community?**  
*Specific management issues for the PAP were not within the scope of this contract and were therefore not dealt with.*

#### 4.4 Local community

- **Why we do not have stadium in WM like the one in Barcelona**  
*WM houses 1% of the population of Barcelona – thus the stadium is smaller*
- **Preservation of the Bedouin tradition and presenting it as a product for tourists & describing the Bedouin culture properly to the tourists**  
*This is fully supported by the consultants and the SMP where it is suggested that a Bedouin Festival (similar to the one organized by the Amariin in Baidah two years ago) or even a permanent Bedouin show should be established.*
- **Should encourage scholarships in the educational strategy**  
*This is recommended in the SMP.*
- **The importance of sharing the local community in preparing the SMP**  
*Of course, consultations with the local community are very important; therefore, interviews were conducted with over 120 Sheikhs of all communities and 20 community workshops*
- **The SMP should take into consideration the land defragmentation among the different tribes while doing the land use planning**  
*The consultants worked on land use plans for the entire Petra Region as well as each of the six communities, however according to the Jordanian law we were not given names of individuals nor tribes who owns the lands, therefore the land ownership map was created with no previous knowledge of names of lands owners. We recommend to PDTRA to work on solving this issue.*
- **Choosing Rajif as the Gate for Petra region**  
*Rajif could only become a gate for visitors arriving from the south. However, it will not be able to move the main access to the PAP from WM, which consequently needs to remain the main access point. Besides, for a small community like Rajif to become the “Gate to the Petra Region” would mean major disturbance of their local traditions.*
- **There should be more detailed information about future job opportunities**  
*The subject of job creation and job opportunities is a recurring theme throughout the SMP. Four scenarios for job creation are presented in the SMP.*
- **Solve the continuous complaints of the local community in Baidha, Rajif and Dlagha**  
*Great emphasis has been put on creating improved infrastructure, better social services and job- and business opportunities particularly for the population of these three communities that so far were benefiting the least from the tourism boom.*
- **Need of direct funds for the sport clubs & support of active associations**  
*The support of youth & sports clubs as well as associations is strongly recommended in the SMP.*



## 4.5 Environment

- **Use the agricultural lands**
- **Establish gardens on the Wadi streams**
- **Did not mention the plans for livestock and horses specially**

*The SMP strongly recommends support of agriculture in order to maintain a mixed economy with income from tourism, agriculture and small industry (manufacturing). Thus, at least the present level of agriculture should be maintained. In addition green house agriculture is recommended and a distinct marketing effort to sell local agricultural products and flowers to the local hotels. This would include herding of goats and sheep for local handicraft (wool, leather) and food (cheese, yoghurt). Horses, camels and donkeys should be kept for the use of animals for treks and in the newly to be created Petra Animal Park which would present an ecologically more appropriate use of animals than is now the case within PAP.*

- **Find solutions for new water resources in the region**
- **Have specific research for the water problem**
- **Agriculture is not an alternative for water scarcity**
- **Solve the water scarcity problem**

*No doubt, water will be the most important challenge to local development. Some measures are recommended in the SMP: e.g. revive all systems of local water harvesting, re-vegetation with plants that will keep moisture, prevent overgrazing, water saving measures in hotels and in the local communities etc. In addition, some water will have to come from outside sources as well: Disi Water aquifer and – in the long perspective – the ‘Red-Dead Canal’ are realistic prospects.*

- **Implement a Geophysical study to research solutions for the soil slides**
- **Does SMP present solution for the landslides and waste problems in WM**
- **SMP should take into consideration global warming and flooding**

*The SMP recommends a number of further environmental measures to be undertaken to prevent landslides and flooding and intensify the already taken waste removal activities.*

- **Protect Rajif’s population from pollution caused by heavy traffic**  
*The proposed Traffic Center near Ein Musa will help reducing traffic in Rajif considerably.*
- **Better planning for WM down town in terms of building roads, to avoid flooding and efficient ways to discharge the accumulated water in winter**  
*The project of ‘Wadi Musa Garden’ as proposed in the SMP is designed to ease traffic in WM, build water catchment areas in the wadis for better use of floodwater. All these measures should lead to a greener WM.*

## 4.6 Comments for PDTRA (administrative & financial issues)

- **Not enough transparency in tendering, the money is wasted because**

**there is no sufficient implementation and monitoring for the projects**

*Jordanian laws were strictly followed in the process; obviously, implementation can happen only once the SMP is completed. PDTRA are committed to full monitoring.*

- **There will be negative impact on the future of Petra region in implementing this Master Plan**  
*PDTRA and the consultants are fully committed to reach the exactly opposite effect*
- **There should be a committee to monitor the implementation of the SMP**
- **Should include a study about the identification and capabilities of staff implementing the SMP**
- **Who are the member of the suggested advisory committee**
- **There is no committee for the implementation process of the SMP**  
*The DMO concept suggested in the SMP foresees a board representing the interests of the local population that would meet this proposal. Furthermore, it would be the task of the DMO to work together with the local community to implement the proposed projects.*
- **Find a solution for Baidha lands ownership issues**  
*This issue was addressed in the land use chapter of the SMP. However, many of the land ownership issues need to be dealt with by the government in consultation with the relevant stakeholders.*
- **Allow building on lands around the Crown Plaza Hotel**  
*The consultants do not recommend this; to the contrary, once this hotel needs complete refurbishing, it is recommended to reconstruct at a different site.*
- **Multiple inquiries from PDTRA, Ministry of Tourism, PNT and ATC are confusing**  
*This is regrettable, but was hardly to be avoided during the work on the SMP.*
- **Why being secretive about the outputs of the SMP**  
*Confidentiality is a necessity during any such process; however, once the main contents of the SMP were presented, nothing will be secret. The full SMP will be made public. The consultants recommend the creation of a publicly accessible Internet database.*
- **Need to include Al-Hay area in the organized PDTRA lands**  
*The Al-Hayy area is prominently displayed in the preliminary land use for WM.*

#### **4.7 Comments on SMP**

- **The need for sustainable solutions**  
*The commitment to sustainable solutions is a core element of the SMP.*
- **Dar Al Handasah Report to be taken in consideration, not to repeat mistakes**

*This report was considered in the SMP*

- **There is a big difference between the strategic vision of the region and the SMP**
- **The SMP presents solutions without details**
- **The 9 months period of SMP is not enough**
- **The outputs are weak, old and not convincing**  
*Such subjective opinions cannot be answered if they are not further specified.*
- **Not approaching and using the data base of the University Hussein Bin Talal socio economic research center**  
*Various representatives of this university were met and asked to provide such information; unfortunately no data was provided.*
- **Where is the data analysis for the carrying capacity of the PAP**  
*PAP was actually not part of the contract; however, an analysis of visitor hours and extrapolation of potential carrying capacity was conducted in order to calculate bed capacities considering previous studies that assessed the carrying capacity.*
- **Where is the data analysis of the population growth and projection, sustainable development and investment plans?**  
*All available data was analyzed, projections were made and different scenarios calculated; a road map for sustainable development and investments suggested.*
- **No sufficient demographic information for Umm Sayhoun**  
*Only information that was given to the consultants was used; specific demographic primary research was neither requested nor possible.*
- **Why was the Islamic cemetery excluded from the SMP?**  
*The SMP does not specifically deal with that issue; therefore it was also not excluded. A Strategic Master Plan is not supposed to go into such detail.*
- **The SMP presented incorrect methodology**  
*The methodology asked for in the contract's terms of reference and the technical proposal of the consultant was followed.*
- **To include Wadi Araba region in the SMP**  
*Even though this area was not mentioned in the contract, the consultants recommend including the area up to the Wadi Araba Road into the PDTRA area. Also include the Masoudha and Dana special zones (because of the same high protection requirements) under the PDTRA management regime.*
- **Why to have 25 m distance away from the Wadis?**  
*This is in line with Jordanian legislation.*
- **We want a plan to protect the water, agriculture and tourism sectors**  
*This is absolutely in line with the strategic direction of the SMP*

- **What is the alternative resource for tourism**  
*Agriculture (including production and collection of herbs!), manufacturing of agro- and handicraft products from Nabatean and Bedouin traditions as well as related services are alternative resources – even though not as strong.*
- **The SMP neglected the social strategy of the Petra region**  
*Many of the most pressing social issues (particularly regarding women and youths) were identified and addressed in the reports for all communities.*
- **The SMP did not take the negative impact of tourism in consideration**  
*The potentially negative impact of tourism is mentioned repeatedly in the SMP; the local population particularly of the communities that are not yet much involved in tourism (Dlagha and Rajif) are invited to choose between inviting tourism to their communities (with potential negative effects on social structure and traditions) or work indirectly for tourism (e.g. producing goods for hotels and visitors).*
- **Why did the SMP focus on having the Petra Region as an international destination only rather than national and regional one**  
*The SMP does not focus on international tourism ONLY. The focus was on creating a destination that compares in quality and attractiveness with leading destination worldwide for the benefit of international, national and regional tourists. Furthermore, the consultants were impressed with the visible pride with which all Jordanians view Petra. Petra is being visited by a large number of Jordanians at a (in the consultants view absolutely justified) lower price. However, economic growth will rather come from more international visitors who are ready to pay higher prices.*
- **Did the team of the SMP do field work**  
*Intensive fieldwork was done in the six communities and in the surrounding areas of newly developable land.*
- **Is the SMP intending to move out the local community from WM to outside claiming to protect the PAP?**  
*Absolutely NO resettlements are planned or suggested.*
- **The presentation did not mention short and long term plans of the SMP**  
*The SMP distinguishes shows a 3-, 7-, and 20-year development scenario, even though this distinction was not mentioned in the presentation.*
- **From where did the team obtain the data which the SMP is based on?**  
*From PDTRA, Jordanian ministries and NGO's. A primary data research was expressively not foreseen in the CfP.*
- **There are maps for natural resources in Petra region that should be taken in consideration.**  
*As far as they were made available to the team, they were considered.*
- **Reconsider the methodology used for identifying the developable lands**

*An objective methodology was used and a proposal made to PDTRA in the context of a Strategic Master Plan. Detailed land use regulations need to be worked out by the PDTRA.*

- **We need sufficient scientific explanation of means of identifying the developable lands**  
*Clearly understandable objective criteria as well as a scientific approach were used and explained in detail in the SMP. A brief explanation is also provided in each community report.*
  
- **Should provide the local community with the exact developable lands**  
*This is planned by PDTRA in the near future.*
  
- **What are the land use maps for the area between WM and Taybeh?**  
*No detailed land use map was prepared for this area, as this was not required in the contract.*
  
- **How do we know that there is no hidden agenda for the work of the Consortium**  
*There is no hidden agenda for the work of the consortium; one reason for choosing an international consortium may have been that they have no connections whatsoever with any of the parties in Jordan. The consortium partners are furthermore independent entities.*
  
- **21 days of field work in WM is not enough**  
*This statement is false: The total number of man/days spent in the field by members of the consultant's team was much higher.*
  
- **Fix the spelling mistakes in the presentation and to avoid using English terms while the presenting it**  
*The contract does not ask for an authorized Arabic version. For a better understanding, the consultants nevertheless have prepared most presentations in Arabic as well; they apologize for any spelling mistakes and have tried to correct them for the final hand-over of files.*
  
- **The importance of sharing the results of the SMP with the local community**  
*This is a most relevant issue and meets the full support and recommendation of the consultants. A SMP will only be successful when it is – after intensive study and discussion by as many stakeholders as possible – understood and – hopefully – in its core findings and recommendations shared by a majority of the local population.*
  
- **What is the experience of the consortium, the presentation quality was weak?**
- **Does Israel have a share in the consortium or the suggested DMO company?**

- **Did the consortium draw back 100000 \$ to the PDTRA?**  
*The answer is NO in all three cases*

## 5 Recommendations to PDTRA regarding PAP boundaries and buffer zone

The consultants' recommendations for the development of the PAP and PDTRA boundaries over a period of time are in three steps:

**Step1:** Extension of the PAP boundaries following natural land characteristics, which can be easily detected on the ground, will help PDTRA in monitoring and protecting the boundaries. These proposed boundaries do NOT include land in Baidha and Umm Sayhoun: nothing changes there.

One needs to recognize that these suggested PAP boundaries are different from the official World Heritage boundaries; the consultants recommend that UNESCO follows this suggestion, since that would make the declaration of a buffer zone obsolete. Also, the so-called "10% rule" (changes of WH-site territory must not be more than 10% of the already determined area) would not apply in this case; because of the lack of previous reference (an informal contact with UNESCO in Paris has confirmed this). However, UNESCO may also choose to declare a smaller zone within PAP as the WH site, which would, however, necessitate careful archaeological investigations as to the comparative value of the different areas of the PAP. In the latter case the remainder of the PAP would be declared the buffer zone. Also in this case, there would be no need for a buffer zone beyond the borders of the PAP.

**Step 2:** A proposal to extend the PDTRA boundaries in order to include the natural sensitive Masoudha and Dana conservation areas, which may indeed require political decisions, because it would change political boundaries in the region.

**Step 3:** Declaration of an extension zone (green area on the map on page 37 of the Map Atlas) to the Wadi Araba Road, which would then also include some extension of PAP OUTSIDE the present PDTRA area.